

International experience of public administration development: What can we learn from other countries?

*Experiencia internacional en el desarrollo de la administración pública:
¿qué podemos aprender de otros países?*

*Experiência internacional de desenvolvimento da administração pública:
o que podemos aprender com outros países?*

Kateryna Serhiivna Izbash¹
Mariana Anatoliivna Balamush²
Stanislav Denysyuk³
Serhiy Serhiyovich Miroshnychenko⁴

Received: August 24th, 2020
Approved: October 6th, 2020
Available: November 15th, 2020

How to cite this article:

Kateryna Serhiivna Izbash, Mariana Anatoliivna Balamush, Stanislav Denysyuk & Serhiy Serhiyovich Miroshnychenko. *International experience of public administration development: What can we learn from other countries?*. DIXI 32, July 2020, 1-13.
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.16925/2357-5891.2020.02.08>

Artículo de investigación. <https://doi.org/10.16925/2357-5891.2020.01.08>

¹ Candidate of Law, Associate Professor, Senior Researcher at the Department of Organization of Scientific Work of the Odessa State University of Internal Affairs.

E-mail: ekaterinaizbash83@gmail.com

ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1855-1383>

² Candidate of Juridical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Administrative and Commercial Law Odesa I. I. Mechnikov National University.

ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6764-2591>

³ Doctor of Law, Professor, Leading Researcher of the Department of Public Law Scientific Institute of Public Law.

ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3449-7911>

⁴ Doctor of Juridical Sciences, Docent, University of the State Fiscal Service of Ukraine, the Department of Criminal Law and Criminology.

ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4286-7484>

Abstract

Objective: The purpose of the article is to analyze the study and the international experience of public administration in order to find the most effective one for Ukraine.

Methodology: While writing the article, the following methods were used: Logical, semantic, documentary analysis, and comparative legal.

Findings: Both positive and negative aspects of borrowing the international experience of developed countries in the field of public administration are considered in the article. The emphasis is placed on the importance of creating an effective system of public administration in the state as a mandatory requirement for its successful functioning. All activities of public authorities are based on the quality of public administration. First of all, these are the processes of organizing management activities and establishing reliable control over it. The definitions of "public administration" and "development of public administration" are provided.

Conclusions: It is concluded that the importance of qualitative study of the positive experience of other countries in the field of public administration will save a lot of time and effort in creating similar processes in their own country, avoiding the mistakes of predecessors. They are based on a thorough study of the formulated strategies and ideas that have been successfully put into practice.

Keywords: International experience, development strategy, overseas assistance, public administration, public management, risk minimization.

Resumen

Objetivo: el propósito de este artículo es analizar el estudio y la experiencia internacional de la administración pública con el fin de encontrar la más eficaz para Ucrania.

Metodología: se utilizaron las siguientes metodologías: lógica, semántica, de análisis documental y jurídica comparativa.

Resultados: se consideran los aspectos tanto positivos como negativos de tomar prestada la experiencia internacional de los países desarrollados en la esfera de la administración pública. Se hace hincapié en la importancia de crear un sistema eficaz de administración pública en el Estado como requisito obligatorio para su buen funcionamiento. Todas las actividades de las autoridades públicas se basan en la calidad de la administración pública. En primer lugar, se trata de los procesos de organización de las actividades de gestión y de establecimiento de un control fiable sobre ella. Se ofrecen las definiciones de "administración pública" y "desarrollo de la administración pública".

Conclusiones: se concluye que la importancia del estudio cualitativo de la experiencia positiva de otros países en el campo de la administración pública ahorrará mucho tiempo y esfuerzo en la creación de procesos similares en su propio país, evitando los errores de sus predecesores. Se basan en un estudio minucioso de las estrategias e ideas formuladas que se han puesto en práctica con éxito.

Palabras clave: experiencia internacional, estrategia de desarrollo, asistencia extranjera, administración pública, gestión pública, minimización del riesgo.

Resumo

Objetivo: o objetivo do artigo é analisar o estudo e a experiência internacional da administração pública a fim de encontrar o mais eficaz para a Ucrânia.

Metodologia: Na redação do artigo, foram utilizados os seguintes métodos: lógico, semântico, análise documental e jurídico comparativo.

Conclusões: Os aspectos positivos e negativos do empréstimo da experiência internacional de países desenvolvidos no campo da administração pública são considerados no artigo. A ênfase é colocada na importância da criação de um sistema eficaz de administração pública no estado como requisito obrigatório para o seu bom funcionamento. Todas as atividades das autoridades públicas são baseadas na qualidade da administração pública. Em primeiro lugar, esses são os processos de organização das atividades de gestão e de estabelecimento de um controle confiável sobre elas. São fornecidas as definições de “administração pública” e “desenvolvimento da administração pública”.

Conclusões: Conclui-se que a importância do estudo qualitativo da experiência positiva de outros países no campo da administração pública poupará muito tempo e esforço na criação de processos semelhantes em seu próprio país, evitando os erros de seus antecessores. Eles são baseados em um estudo aprofundado das estratégias formuladas e das ideias que foram colocadas em prática com sucesso.

Palavras-chave: Experiência internacional, estratégia de desenvolvimento, assistência no exterior, administração pública, gestão pública, minimização de riscos.

1. INTRODUCTION

It is undeniable that a key success factor for any public policy is the adoption and proper implementation of a science-based program of public administration. The importance of effective public administration lays, in particular, in the fact that it allows public relations actors to significantly reduce or minimize possible losses and risks in their daily activities, thereby gaining more benefits.

The entities of public relations have the opportunity to benefit from the above processes also because they will be able to maximize their interests and protect their rights and freedoms. At this stage of public relations development, the urgent importance of developing and implementing a modern program of effective public administration in various spheres of society is stressed. Particular emphasis is placed on the need to support international cooperation in times of active globalization.

The main goal of any manager in the public-private sphere is to achieve maximum efficiency, validity and effectiveness with minimal resources, time and effort. The main task that a public manager faces is different from the task of a business manager. The public manager cares about how to use public infrastructure rationally for the production of public goods and to meet public interest¹.

It is worth to note that most of the constitutional rights of citizens, foreigners, stateless persons are exercised at the level of local self-government. Thus local self-government plays a special role in the public administration mechanism, it ensures the interconnection among society, the individual and the state. Harmonized

1 O. Z. Bosak. *Formation and development of the system of public administration in Ukraine*. Ed. I. A. Hrytsiak. PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION REFORM IN UKRAINE: CHALLENGES, STRATEGIES, FUTURE. K.I.S. (2009). Pg. 73.

interaction between public authorities and local authorities can be achieved through a clear definition and allocation of their competence and responsibility. This led to decentralization processes and local government reforms in many countries. In some EU countries, a movement towards the reduction of the number of local or regional governments or the suppression of an administrative tier with a redistribution of its competences could be observed. Many countries have introduced the substantive local self-government reforms to either reduce the number of municipalities (Czech Republic, Estonia, Greece, Latvia in 2009), or to create joint bodies among municipalities in order to share tasks and costs (France, Hungary, Italy, Luxembourg, Slovenia)².

The purpose of this article is to identify proposals and recommendations to ensure the effective functioning of the public administration system in Ukraine. The main emphasis is on the study and analysis of foreign public administration systems in order to find the most effective for Ukraine.

2. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND METHODS

Based on the socio-scientific relevance of issues related to the content of the main topic of this article, it should be emphasized that the field of public administration has been considered by many experts. Due to the depth and heterogeneity of this area, it has been studied at different times and in different aspects. The conclusions made by some scientists at a certain time later changed to more modern and perfect ones.

The study of the fundamental regularities of this area involved many highly qualified specialists from research areas related to public administration. Among these are Management, Law (Jurisprudence), Economics and more. In the context of our study, the scientific works of such scientists as Antonova O. V., Blazhivska M. A., Borodin E. I., Bosak O. Z., Dziana G. O., Dzianyi R. B., Hurst H., Khozhlyo I. I., Kolodii A. F., Kuibida M., Lipentsev A. V., Lypovska N. A., Minenko M., Prokopenko L. L., Serohin S. M. and Zahorskyi V. S. should be highlighted.

The methodological basis includes a set of general and special methods of scientific knowledge. The system approach as a general scientific method allowed to identify problematic issues related to the study of international experience of public administration development. The logical and semantic method within this study

2 T. Semigina, O. Maidannyk, Y. Onischyk & Y. Zhuravel. *Local self-government reforms in Europe: Legal aspects of considering the communities' social identity*. JURIDICAL TRIBUNE 2. 2020. Pg. 207-221, 207-208; Nick Thijs, Gerhard Hammerschmid & Enora Palaric. *A COMPARATIVE OVERVIEW OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION CHARACTERISTICS AND PERFORMANCE IN EU28*. European Commission. (2018). Available at: <https://ec.europa.eu>

provided an opportunity to consider the essence of the concept of "public administration". The method of documentary analysis was used to formulate both intermediate conclusions and general conclusions within the analysis. Using the comparative legal method, the peculiarities of public administration in some foreign countries were analyzed, which made it possible to understand that today Ukraine lags far behind in the development of the legislative framework for the effective formation of local self-government.

3. ANALYSIS OF THE FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Modern public administration in Ukraine is characterized by the emergence of new institutions that directly or indirectly receive, through the delegation procedure, a set of functions that due to objective and subjective circumstances cannot be effectively performed by public authorities³. In particular, today the development of public administration is characterized by the empowering of society through decentralization, namely through the creation of territorial communities. The practical implementation of the process of unification of territorial communities began in mid-2015. The adoption, on February 5, 2015 by the Verkhovna Rada, of the Law of Ukraine "On Voluntary Association of Territorial Communities"⁴ and the Government's approval of the methodology of formation of capable territorial communities legally launched the process of voluntary association of territorial communities, which is a part of the local self-government reform in Ukraine. Territorial communities are the basis of local self-government in Ukraine. The issues of unification of territorial communities, their capacity and cooperation as a new form of local and regional development policy are especially relevant during the period of local self-government reform and the process of decentralization of power. The need to create capable territorial communities is the calling of our time⁵.

In general, it should be noted that the term "public administration" is mostly considered as the activity of elected or appointed persons to manage the industry

3 M. A. Minenko. *Transformation of the governance into modern model of regulation of the society*. ELECTRONIC SCIENTIFIC JOURNAL DERZHAVNE UPRAVLINNYA: UDOSKONALENNYA TA ROZVYTOK 6. 2013. Available at: <http://www.dy.nayka.com.ua/?op=1&z=581>

4 Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine. Law 157-VIII of 2015. "On Voluntary Association of Territorial Communities". May 02, 2015. Available at: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/157-19#Text>

5 G. O. Dziana & R. B. Dzianyi. COOPERATION AS A TOOL TO ENSURE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT OF TERRITORIAL COMMUNITIES. Lridu Nadu. (2018). Pg. 8.

entrusted to them through a certain set of tools. Administration, in particular, involves creation and further implementation of a certain number of legal acts aimed at establishing universally accepted operating rules for all, without exception, actors of public relations.

The tradition of issuing all kinds of decrees and orders by state authorities, which established appropriate rules, restrictions and prohibitions in various spheres of public life, is well known since the beginning of the first centralized states. The importance of flexible public administration of certain spheres of society is that it allows introducing modern fair norms (rules) for the activities of entities in a particular area of public relations, under the guise of the authority of the state. That is, the fact that regulations are created and issued on behalf of the state helps to ensure their binding.

In recent years, it has been emphasized that any legal acts enacted by public authorities must guarantee the respect and protection of the minimum necessary inalienable rights of individuals. This list should primarily include the fundamental rights, freedoms and legitimate interests of man and citizen. After all, in the 21st century, almost every country in the world has committed itself to protecting the above personal non-property rights. An example of this is the numerous treaties and conventions signed by state governments and subsequently ratified by their legislatures. The content of these conventions and treaties is common to the signatory countries, views on the fundamental rights and freedoms on the basis of which they agreed to enact essentially identical legislation to protect the above human goods.

Particular attention is also paid to ensuring the rights and interests of the so-called "minorities" that take place in the society of any country. These minorities can be of different nature, for example: National, religious, social, racial, sexual, etc. Therefore, all fundamental rights and freedoms that, according to the current legislation, any person can count on should be observed when the governing bodies carry out public administration activities. And, accordingly, it is the responsibility of management entities to prevent cases of violation of the above rights and freedoms, as well as to actively counteract these cases⁶.

The active processes of globalization observed around the world also have a significant impact on public relations between actors, including the field of public administration. Successful traditions and practices applied in a number of developed countries set a general "trend" in the field of public administration at various levels in

6 Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. *Resolution No. 704 of 22.06.2011 "On Reduction of Quantity and Consolidation of State Target Programmers"*. OFFICIAL GAZETTE OF UKRAINE 51. 2011. Art. 2036.

most parts of the world. Such influence from successful countries often becomes a catalyst for the development of public administration in developing countries.

According to scientific sources, in contrast to state administration, "public administration" is a purposeful interaction of public administrations with legal entities and individuals to ensure the implementation of laws and regulations and perform some basic functions: Indicative planning, which determines the desired directions of development; creation of legal, economic and other conditions for the realization of the interests of the participants of interaction; division of labor; cooperation and coordination of activities; monitoring of results⁷.

Most of the authoritative scientists and individuals involved in the study of the field of public administration point out that, in addition to the above signs, the key component of effective public administration is the complete political impartiality of the governing entities in the exercise of their powers. This thesis means that, with the exception of a few high-level state leaders (heads of government, ministers, heads of state), who, according to the law, have the right to openly represent the interests of their political forces, the governing entities of other links and spheres of government must resolutely refrain from preferring a political position over effective administration.

4. EXPERIENCE OF EU COUNTRIES: WHAT CAN WE LEARN?

When actors abandon political adventures in favor of quality, efficient administration, they get impressive results after a while. Management relations in North America and the European Union can be an example of such a state of affairs. In these countries, there is an active practice of hiring persons who are prohibited from representing any political force or openly expressing their political position. This is done so that a certain managerial work, such as the management of a certain department or service, is carried out by a professional who works for an effective result, as well as for the benefit of the department itself.

Such a position in the local self-government bodies of Western countries is called "city manager", and its purpose is to perform management functions over the city by a person who is hired, not a political figure. He receives a salary from the city depending on the effectiveness of his work, namely on the degree of achievement of the pursued objectives. At the same time, political power and the right to make key

7 L. L. Prokopenko (Ed.). EUROPEANIZATION OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN UKRAINE IN THE CONTEXT OF EUROPEAN INTEGRATION. Druda Nadu. (2009). Pg. 77-78.

(global) decisions on the further functioning of the city belong to the head of the city (usually the mayor or burgomaster), who is the elected political figure⁸.

The Croatian public administration reforms have been conducted in a patchy and bumpy manner. An attempt to initiate a more systematic reform, by means of the Strategy of State Administration Reform of 2008, has resulted in humble success, as only some of the measures have been fully or partially implemented. After four years without any general strategic document about public administration reform, the second Strategy of Public Administration Development 2015-2020 was adopted by the Parliament only in 2015. However, the Action Plan for its implementation, prepared in line with the requirements of the European Commission, was adopted only at the very end of 2016. The tradition inherited from the pre-socialist period is mainly based on the continental European "Weberian" model of state bureaucracy impregnated with legalism, formalism, rigid leadership and discipline. The tradition from socialism partly deviates from that of other former socialist countries because of the well-known self-management experiment, which raised a sense for citizens' participation in local matters and issues of minor importance. However, similar to the other socialist countries, there was a parallel system of coordination in the most important aspects of public governance, through the dominant political party based on arbitrary political will in a quasi-dictatorial manner. That is probably why over-politicization co-exists with legalism, formalism and red tape. One of the results is low reform, innovation and initiative capacities⁹.

The primary unit of local self-government in Poland was the commune, which – in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Poland on Self-Governing Community, 1990 – was at the same time an administrative-territorial unit with legal personality¹⁰. Since the first free elections on May 27, 1990, Poland has moved toward complete reform of local governments, decentralization and the creation of conditions and opportunities for direct democratic influence of citizens¹¹. Thus, Poland, unlike Ukraine, was able to form an effective model of local self-government in a shorter

8 A. F. Kolodii. *Terms and concepts of democratic governance as a direction of political research*. DEMOCRATIC GOVERNANCE IN THE CONTEXT OF GLOBAL CHALLENGES AND CRISES. Lridu Nadu. (2009).

9 I. Koprić. *One Candle, Two Candles... Is There the Third One? Croatian Public Administration Reform before and after the EU Accession*. NISPACEE JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND POLICY 1. 2018. Pg. 41-61.

10 A. Sauer. *The system of the local self-governments in Poland*. ASSOCIATION FOR INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS. RESEARCH PAPER 6/2013. December 2013. Available at: <https://www.amo.cz/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/amocz-RP-2013-6.pdf>

11 Kocon Włodzimierz. *Local government in Poland. Part I: The reform*. SOCIAL EDUCATION 6. 1991. Pg. 360-366, 360.

time. Formation of effective local self-government is possible only on the foundation of civil society. Thus, every reform should begin not only at the initiative of the state, but also with the support and active participation of the local population¹². The 1998 reform finally changed the territorial organization of the country: Reintroduced the medium-level districts (*powiats*) and consolidated regions (*województwo*) (49 small regions have been replaced by 16 stronger ones). New territorial units received their own scope of local-governmental power and financial resources¹³.

It should be noted that these examples of the organization and implementation of public administration by the authorities, as well as other governing bodies in developed countries, have confidently proven their effectiveness. As practice shows, qualitative training of highly qualified management staff, together with the subsequent transfer of management functions in certain areas, has led to a significant optimization of the public administration system, making it both flexible and efficient.

The experience of foreign countries shows the usefulness of a competitive approach in the professional training of public servants. The competition of educational institutions in the professional training of public servants will contribute to their competitiveness in particular and to the civil service in general. After all, expert and analytical assistance and relevant education can be provided not only by public educational institutions, but also by the private sector¹⁴.

Among other things, it should be noted that it is useful for the public administration to introduce some approaches and methods of the private sector. These include, for example, the tradition of conducting an independent evaluation and the practice of appointing a candidate through competitive selection. With regard to independent evaluation, it should be noted that it can test both the knowledge and professional skills of individuals and the effectiveness of a particular body or department (audit)¹⁵. But experts mostly emphasize that the creation of an effective system of public administration is not possible without the existence of a dynamically functioning regulatory body that would feel the subtleties of current public relations, and therefore would adjust the current rules. It is clear that such a body should be the legislative body of state power (parliament). It is science-based relevant and important for society

12 M. A. Blazhivska. FOREIGN PRACTICES IN ENSURING THE DEVELOPMENT OF TERRITORIAL COMMUNITIES BY PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION METHODS. Lridu Nadu. (2018). Pg. 30.

13 A. Sauer, *op. cit.*, note 14.

14 S. M. Serohin, E. I. Borodin, N. A. Lypovska, et al. REFORMING THE PROFESSIONAL TRAINING OF CIVIL SERVANTS IN UKRAINE: PROBLEMS AND PROSPECTS. National Academy of Public Administration. (2013).

15 S. M. Serohin, O. V. Antonova, I. I. Khozhylo, et al. MORAL AND ETHICAL PRINCIPLES OF CIVIL SERVICE DEVELOPMENT OF UKRAINE: EUROPEAN AND DOMESTIC EXPERIENCE. Dridu Nadu. (2007).

regulations, aimed at establishing the most favorable conditions for the management industry, will be the catalyst for success for the whole system¹⁶.

Comparing the experience gained by some developed countries in their implementation of public administration programs (both at the national and local levels), a number of experts tried to identify the most effective strategy for the development of public administration. To achieve this goal, scientists have studied a large number of measures taken by the state leadership of developed countries to improve the quality of the management system in the country. In particular, the impact of various factors on the management sphere was considered¹⁷.

In the general sense of consideration of this issue, it should be noted that the peculiarities of the effective implementation of public policy in the field of public administration have interested people for a long time. The tradition of public administration in ancient Rome is among the earliest examples in history. In this majestic empire at the time, many magistrates were united by a common goal of establishing a unified and, at the same time, multifaceted system of public administration that could effectively manage vast territories, ensuring their peace, security, and prosperity.

Over time, public administration systems improved and replaced each other. However, one thing remained unchanged, namely the will of the state leadership to maximize the effectiveness of their control over the territory under their control and increase its profitability. That is, regardless of whether the state regime in the country is authoritarian or democratic, quality development is extremely necessary for them, because it will allow more flexible management of various (including human) resources of the state¹⁸.

Perhaps the only difference in the approach to public administration between authoritarian and democratic regimes is that the leadership of liberal democracies understands the temporality of their tenure, and therefore tries to bring the country the maximum benefit in a timely manner. Therefore, according to this logic, senior and middle managers carry out professional administration of the sphere of public activity entrusted to them.

Achievement of concrete positive results in a clearly defined time frame is a must for further evaluation of their work. In the absence of such results, the current

16 M. Kuibida. *Formation of the conceptual apparatus as an integral part of the institutional development of the civil service of Ukraine*. BULLETIN OF THE CIVIL SERVICE OF UKRAINE 3. 2008. Pg. 34-39, 35.

17 Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. *Order No. 474-r of 24.06.2016 "Some issues of public administration reform in Ukraine"*. OFFICIAL GAZETTE OF UKRAINE 55. 2016. Art. 1919.

18 Hurst Hannum. *The concept of human rights*. Eds. Hurst Hannum, S. James Anaya & Dinah Shelton. INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS: PROBLEMS OF LAW, POLICY, AND PRACTICE. Aspen Publishers. (2006). Pg. 31-33.

leadership loses its positions and powers, and new people who are able to ensure the achievement of the necessary success for the country replace it. It should be emphasized that one of the main criteria for selecting future managers in the developed countries of the West is provision of information about their clear and phased development strategy for the industry they are going to lead, as well as information about methods and means by which they intend to improve this industry. In this context, it should be emphasized that due to the need to constantly record and verify the results achieved in almost every area of life, governments and private entities in developed democracies have achieved remarkable success in assessing the quality of work. Numerous rating and audit agencies have long been considered the most authoritative sources of evaluation.

In addition to the high quality of the direct implementation of various management activities, it requires clear legal regulation on the part of legislature. Clear and unambiguous in content acts are exactly what is needed to improve the efficiency of the public administration system¹⁹.

5. CONCLUSIONS

Thus, the study reveals that public administration as a social phenomenon, its forms, methods, principles and specific mechanisms are determined by the existing needs of socio-economic development. European integration processes highlight new requirements for the system of functioning of the national system of public administration, which should become an effective and efficient means of state administration, promote openness and transparency in the development of public relations and more.

In turn, based on the study of the experience of foreign countries, it can be concluded that the development of public administration should be based on the simultaneous qualitative improvement of several aspects related to this area. First of all, we are talking about improving legislative regulation as the main condition for efficiency. Changes in the assessment of the quality of management activities are also important.

19 V. S. Zahorskyi & A. V. Lipentsev (Eds.). **DEMOCRATIC STANDARDS OF GOVERNANCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**. Lviv. (2008).

REFERENCES

- A. Sauer. *The system of the local self-governments in Poland*. ASSOCIATION FOR INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS. RESEARCH PAPER 6/2013. December 2013. Available at: <https://www.amo.cz/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/amocz-RP-2013-6.pdf>
- A. F. Kolodii. *Terms and concepts of democratic governance as a direction of political research*. DEMOCRATIC GOVERNANCE IN THE CONTEXT OF GLOBAL CHALLENGES AND CRISES. Lridu Nadu. (2009).
- Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. *Order No. 474-r of 24.06.2016 "Some issues of public administration reform in Ukraine"*. OFFICIAL GAZETTE OF UKRAINE 55. 2016. Art. 1919.
- Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. *Resolution No. 704 of 22.06.2011 "On Reduction of Quantity and Consolidation of State Target Programmers"*. OFFICIAL GAZETTE OF UKRAINE 51. 2011. Art. 2036.
- G. O. Dziana & R. B. Dzianyi. COOPERATION AS A TOOL TO ENSURE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT OF TERRITORIAL COMMUNITIES. Lridu Nadu. (2018).
- Hurst Hannum. *The concept of human rights*. Eds. Hurst Hannum, S. James Anaya & Dinah Shelton. INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS: PROBLEMS OF LAW, POLICY, AND PRACTICE. Aspen Publishers. (2006). Pg. 31-33.
- I. Koprčić. *One Candle, Two Candles... Is There the Third One? Croatian Public Administration Reform before and after the EU Accession*. NISPACEE JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND POLICY 1. 2018. Pg. 41-61.
- Kocon Włodzimierz. *Local government in Poland. Part I: The reform*. SOCIAL EDUCATION 6. 1991. Pg. 360-366.
- L. L. Prokopenko (Ed.). EUROPEANIZATION OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN UKRAINE IN THE CONTEXT OF EUROPEAN INTEGRATION. Druda Nadu. (2009).
- M. Kuibida. *Formation of the conceptual apparatus as an integral part of the institutional development of the civil service of Ukraine*. BULLETIN OF THE CIVIL SERVICE OF UKRAINE 3. 2008. Pg. 34-39.
- M. A. Blazhivska. FOREIGN PRACTICES IN ENSURING THE DEVELOPMENT OF TERRITORIAL COMMUNITIES BY PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION METHODS. Lridu Nadu. (2018).

- M. A. Minenko. *Transformation of the governance into modern model of regulation of the society*. ELECTRONIC SCIENTIFIC JOURNAL DERZHAVNE UPRAVLINNYA: UDOSKONALENNYA TA ROZVYTKO 6. 2013. Available at: <http://www.dy.nayka.com.ua/?op=1&z=581>
- N. Thijs, G. Hammerschmid & E. Palaric. A COMPARATIVE OVERVIEW OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION CHARACTERISTICS AND PERFORMANCE IN EU28. European Commission. (2018). Available at: <https://ec.europa.eu>
- O. Z. Bosak. *Formation and development of the system of public administration in Ukraine*. Ed. I. A. Hrytsiak. PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION REFORM IN UKRAINE: CHALLENGES, STRATEGIES, FUTURE. K.I.S. (2009).
- S. M. Serohin, O. V. Antonova, I. I. Khozhylo, et al. MORAL AND ETHICAL PRINCIPLES OF CIVIL SERVICE DEVELOPMENT OF UKRAINE: EUROPEAN AND DOMESTIC EXPERIENCE. Dridu Nadu. (2007).
- S. M. Serohin, E. I. Borodin, N. A. Lypovska, et al. REFORMING THE PROFESSIONAL TRAINING OF CIVIL SERVANTS IN UKRAINE: PROBLEMS AND PROSPECTS. National Academy of Public Administration. (2013).
- T. Semigina, O. Maidannyk, Y. Onischyk & Y. Zhuravel. *Local self-government reforms in Europe: Legal aspects of considering the communities' social identity*. JURIDICAL TRIBUNE 2. 2020. Pg. 207-221.
- V. S. Zahorskyi & A. V. Lipentsev (Eds.). DEMOCRATIC STANDARDS OF GOVERNANCE AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION. Lviv. (2008).
- Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine. Law 157-VIII of 2015. "On Voluntary Association of Territorial Communities". May 02, 2015. Available at: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/157-19#Text>